1	Nathan R. Ring	
2	Nevada State Bar No. 12078	
	STRANCH, JENNINGS & GARVEY, PLLC 3100 W. Charleston Boulevard, Suite 208	
3	Las Vegas, Nevada 89102	
4	(725) 235-9750	
5	lasvegas@stranchlaw.com	
6	Jeff Ostrow*  KOPELOWITZ OSTROW P.A.	
7	One West Las Olas Blvd., Suite 500	
	Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33301	
8	(954) 525-4100 (954) 525-4300 (facsimile)	
9	ostrow@kolawyers.com	
10	Counsel for Plaintiff Tonya Owens	
11	and the Proposed Class	
12	(additional counsel on following pages)	
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		

#### 1 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF NEVADA 2 TONYA OWENS, individually and on behalf Case No. 2:23-cv-01480-JAD-VCF 3 of all others similarly situated, (filed September 21, 2023, D. Nev.) 4 Plaintiff, **PLAINTIFFS' MOTION** 5 TO CONSOLIDATE FOR PRETRIAL v. PROCEEDINGS AND INTEGRATED 6 MEMORANDUM OF LAW IN SUPPORT MGM RESORTS INTERNATIONAL, 7 Defendant. 8 EMILY KIRWAN, individually and on behalf Case No. 2:23-cv-01481-RFB-DJA 9 of all others similarly situated, (filed September 21, 2023, D. Nev.) 10 Plaintiff, v. 11 12 MGM RESORTS INTERNATIONAL, 13 Defendant. 14 DAVID ZUSSMAN, individually and on behalf Case No. 2:23-cv-01537-CDS-BNW of all others similarly situated, (filed September 27, 2023, D. Nev.) 15 16 Plaintiff, 17 v. 18 VICI PROPERTIES L.P.; MGM RESORTS **INTERNATIONAL**; and MGM GROWTH 19 PROPERTIES OPERATING 20 PARTNERSHIP L.P. 21 Defendants 22 DAVID LACKEY, individually and on behalf Case No. 2:23-cv-01549-RFB-NJK of all others similarly situated, (filed September 28, 2023, D. Nev.) 23 24 Plaintiff, 25 MGM RESORTS INTERNATIONAL, 26 27 Defendant.

1	MICHAEL PIRCIO, individually and on	Case No. 2:23-cv-01550-CDS-NJK
	behalf of all others similarly situated,	(filed September 28, 2023, D. Nev.)
2		, , , , ,
3	Plaintiff, v.	
4	··	
5	MGM RESORTS INTERNATIONAL,	
6	Defendant.	
7	LAURA WILLIS ALBRIGO and ANITA	Case No. 3:23-cv-01797-JLS-BLM
	JOHNSON, individually and on behalf of all	(filed September 28, 2023, S.D. Cal.,
8	others similarly situated,	transf. November 17, 2023, D. Nev.)
9	Plaintiffs,	
10	v.	
11	MGM RESORTS INTERNATIONAL,	
12	Defendant.	
13	<b>DAVID TEREZO</b> , individually and on behalf	Case No. 2:23-cv-01577-JAD-VCF
14	of all others similarly situated,	(filed October 3, 2023, D. Nev.)
15	Plaintiff, v.	
16		
17	MGM RESORTS INTERNATIONAL,	
18	Defendant.	
19	<b>RONALD G. RUNDELL,</b> individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,	Case No. 2:23-cv-01698-CDS-DJA (filed October 18, 2023, D. Nev.)
20		
21	Plaintiff, v.	
22	MGM RESORTS INTERNATIONAL,	
23	Defendant.	
24	Defendant.	
25		
26		
27		
28		

CHARLES BEZAK, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

MGM RESORTS INTERNATIONAL,

Defendant.

PAUL ZARI, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

MGM RESORTS INTERNATIONAL,

Defendant.

MICHAEL MANSON, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

MGM RESORTS INTERNATIONAL,

Defendant.

Case No. 2:23-cv-01719-RFB-BNW (filed October 20, 2023, D. Nev.)

Case No. 2:23-cv-01777-CDS-BNW (filed November 1, 2023, D. Nev.)

Case No. 2:23-cv-01826-CDS-EJY (filed November 7, 2023, D. Nev.)

# PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO CONSOLIDATE FOR PRETRIAL PROCEEDINGS AND INTEGRATED MEMORANDUM OF LAW IN SUPPORT

Under Rule 42(a) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, Plaintiffs, TONYA OWENS, EMILY KIRWAN, DAVID ZUSSMAN, DAVID LACKEY, MICHAEL PIRCIO, LAURA WILLIS ALBRIGO and ANITA JOHNSON, DAVID TEREZO, RONALD G. RUNDELL, CHARLES BEZAK, PAUL ZARI, and MICHAEL MANSON, each individually, and on behalf of all others similarly situated (hereinafter, "Plaintiffs"), move the Court to consolidate the above styled actions against Defendants, MGM RESORTS INTERNATIONAL ("MGM") and VICI PROPERTIES L.P. and MGM GROWTH PROPERTIES OPERATING PARTNERSHIP L.P., for

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

4893-1083-5374, v. 1

pretrial proceedings, respectfully stating as follows:

WHEREAS, Plaintiffs seek to consolidate the following putative class actions (the "Related Actions") filed between September 21, 2023 and November 7, 2023, and any subsequently filed actions, under Fed. R. Civ. P. 42(a):

<b>Abbreviated Case Name</b>	Case No.	<b>Date Filed</b>
Owens v. MGM Resorts International	2:23-cv-01480	9/21/2023
Kirwan v. MGM Resorts International	2:23-cv-01481	9/21/2023
Zussman v. VICI Properties 1 LLC, et al.	2:23-cv-01537	9/27/2023
Lackey v. MGM Resorts International	2:23-cv-01549	9/28/2023
Pircio v. MGM Resorts International	2:23-cv-01550	9/28/2023
Albrigo v. MGM Resorts International	3:23-cv-01797	9/28/2023
Terezo v. MGM Resorts International	2:23-cv-01577	10/3/2023
Rundell v. MGM Resorts International	2:23-cv-01698	10/18/2023
Bezak v. MGM Resorts International	2:23-cv-01719	10/20/2023
Zari v. MGM Resorts International	2:23-cv-01777	11/1/2023
Manson v. MGM Resorts International	2:23-cv-01826	11/7/2023

WHEREAS, under Fed. R. Civ. P. 42(a), the Court may consolidate actions before it if involving common questions of law and fact. Such consolidation "permits district courts 'to expedite the trial and eliminate unnecessary repetition and confusion." *Houghton v. Rancho Mesquite Casino, Inc.*, No. 223CV00276CDSDJA, 2023 WL 2633742, at \*1 (D. Nev. Mar. 24, 2023) quoting *DuPont v. S. Pac. Co.*, 366 F.2d 193, 195 (5th Cir. 1966). In deciding whether to consolidate cases, the Court "weigh[s] the interest of judicial convenience against the potential for delay, confusion[,] and prejudice." *Id.* (quoting *Zhu v. UCBH Holdings, Inc.*, 682 F. Supp. 2d 1049, 1052 (N.D. Cal. 2010)); *see also Huene v. United States*, 743 F.2d 703, 704 (9th Cir. 1984).

WHEREAS, these Related Actions allege nearly identical claims against Defendants, arising from MGM's failures to adequately safeguard the personally identifiable information ("PII") entrusted to it by its customers, resulting in a cyberattack and data breach to MGM systems in September 2023 in which the PII of Plaintiffs and the proposed Class Members, members of MGM's loyalty program, was unauthorizedly disclosed and compromised (the "Data Breach").

1 See, e.g., Owens Action Complaint ¶¶ 1-3; Zari Action Complaint ¶¶ 2-3, 5; MGM Notice of Data 2 Breach. This includes their full names, dates of birth, addresses, email addresses, phone numbers, 3 Social Security numbers and/or driver's license numbers. *Owens* Action Compl. ¶ 1. Only (1) one 4 of these eleven (11) Related Actions involves other Defendants, Zussman v. VICI Properties 1 5 LLC, et al., Case No. 2:23-cv-01537, which names VICI Properties, L.P. and MGM Growth 6 Properties Operating Partnership, L.P., as defendants in addition to MGM. The Related Actions 7 8 have proposed class definitions that will encompass the same persons, e.g., all individuals residing 9 in the United States whose personal identifiable information was disclosed in the Data Breach 10 (Owens Compl. ¶ 126), and arise from the same general set of factual allegations relating to the 11 same Data Breach. Accordingly, the Related Actions involve common questions of law and fact, 12 and should be consolidated under Fed. R. Civ. P. 42(a); 13 14 15 16

WHEREAS Plaintiffs agree the Related Actions should be consolidated for pretrial proceedings into the *Owens* Action (Case No. 2:23-cv-01480) for purposes of judicial economy;

WHEREAS, Plaintiffs from the Related Cases have coordinated and agree that it would be duplicative and wasteful of the Court's and the parties' resources to litigate the cases separately. See Houghton v. Rancho Mesquite Casino, Inc., No. 2:23-cv-00276-CDS-DJA, 2023 WL 2633742, at \*1 (D. Nev. Mar. 24, 2023) (for the purposes of expediting trial and eliminating unnecessary repetition, district courts have broad discretion under this rule to consolidate cases pending in the same district);

23

17

18

19

20

21

22

24

25

26

<sup>1</sup> See Notice of Data Breach, MGM (Oct. 5, 2023), https://www.mgmresorts.com/en/notice-of-27 data-breach.html (last visited Oct. 17, 2023).

WHEREAS, in an effort to assure consistent rulings and decisions and to avoid unnecessary duplication of effort, all counsel for Plaintiffs in the Related Actions, jointly move this Court for entry of an order consolidating the Related Actions for pre-trial proceedings; Defendant has been consulted and has responded they wish to retain the right to oppose; and

**NOW, THEREFORE**, Plaintiffs submit the following to the Court for approval:

The following Related Actions are hereby consolidated for all pretrial proceedings 1. ("Consolidated Action"):

<b>Abbreviated Case Name</b>	Case No.	Date Filed
Owens v. MGM Resorts International	2:23-cv-01480	9/21/2023
Kirwan v. MGM Resorts International	2:23-cv-01481	9/21/2023
Zussman v. VICI Properties 1 LLC, et al.	2:23-cv-01537	9/27/2023
Lackey v. MGM Resorts International	2:23-cv-01549	9/28/2023
Pircio v. MGM Resorts International	2:23-cv-01550	9/28/2023
Albrigo v. MGM Resorts International	3:23-cv-01797	9/28/2023
Terezo v. MGM Resorts International	2:23-cv-01577	10/3/2023
Rundell v. MGM Resorts International	2:23-cv-01698	10/18/2023
Bezak v. MGM Resorts International	2:23-cv-01719	10/20/2023
Zari v. MGM Resorts International	2:23-cv-01777	11/1/2023
Manson v. MGM Resorts International	2:23-cv-01826	11/7/2023

2. Every pleading filed in the Consolidated Action shall bear the following caption:

## UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEVADA

### In Re MGM RESORTS INTERNATIONAL DATA BREACH LITIGATION

#### **Master File No. 2:23-cv-01480**

(Consolidated for pretrial proceedings with Case Nos. 2:23-cv-01481, 2:23-cv-01537, 2:23-cv-01549, 2:23-cv-01550, 3:23-cv-01797, 2:23-cv-01577, 2:23-cv-01698, 2:23-cv-01719, 2:23-cv-01777, 2:23-cv-01826)

CONSOLIDATED CLASS ACTION

27

26

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

28

The files of the Consolidated Action shall be maintained in one file under Master 3.

File No. 2:23-cv-01480;

- 4. Should a case that arises out of the same subject matter of the Consolidated Action subsequently be filed in this Court or transferred from another Court, a motion may be made to consolidate it with these Related Cases. Nothing in the foregoing shall be construed as a waiver of Defendants' rights to object to consolidation of any subsequently filed or transferred related actions;
- 5. Defendants do not waive their rights to move to dismiss the Consolidated Action or any individual action, to oppose class certification under Fed. R. Civ. P. 23 or the appointment of class counsel on any grounds, or to oppose joinder of plaintiffs to one another including for purposes of trial;
- 6. Under Fed. R. Civ. P. 5(b)(2)(E), service by e-mail transmission shall be permitted in addition to service via ECF notification;
  - 7. Upon granting of this Motion, all deadlines in all of the Related Actions are stayed;
- 8. Leadership applications, pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(g)(3), shall be filed within 20 days of the date of an Order granting this Motion;
- 9. Plaintiffs shall file a superseding consolidated amended complaint no later than 45 days following the appointment of interim class counsel;
- 10. Defendants shall have 45 days from the filing of the superseding consolidated amended complaint to file a motion to dismiss or otherwise respond to that complaint; Plaintiffs shall have 45 days thereafter to file their opposition; and Defendants shall have 30 days thereafter to file a reply in support.

A proposed order granting the Motion is attached hereto.

1	Dated: March 19, 2024.	Respectfully submitted,
2		/s/ Nathan R. Ring
3		Nathan R. Ring
4		Nevada State Bar No. 12078 STRANCH, JENNINGS & GARVEY, PLLC
5		3100 W. Charleston Boulevard, Suite 208
		Las Vegas, Nevada 89102 (725) 235-9750
6		lasvegas@stranchlaw.com
7		Jeff Ostrow*
8		KOPELOWITZ OSTROW, P.A. One West Las Olas Blvd., Suite 500
9		Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33301
10		(954) 525-4100 (954) 525-4300 (facsimile)
11		ostrow@kolawyers.com
12		Counsel for Plaintiff Tonya Owens and the
13		Proposed Class
14		Nathan R. Ring
15		Nevada State Bar No. 12078 STRANCH, JENNINGS & GARVEY, PLLC
16		3100 W. Charleston Boulevard, Suite 208 Las Vegas, Nevada 89102
		(725) 235-9750
17		lasvegas@stranchlaw.com
18		Jeff Ostrow*
19		KOPELOWITZ OSTROW P.A. One West Las Olas Blvd., Suite 500
20		Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33301 (954) 525-4100
21		(954) 525-4300 (facsimile)
22		ostrow@kolawyers.com
23		Counsel for Plaintiff Emily Kirwan
24		and the Proposed Class
25		John A. Love* LOVE CONSUMER LAW
26		2500 Northwinds Parkway, Suite 330
27		30009, Suite 330 Alpharetta, Georgia 30009
28		Inplication, Georgia 50007
48 L	1	

1 (404) 855-3600 tlove@loveconsumerlaw.com 2 Maureen M. Brady 3 McShane & Brady, LCC 1656 Washington Street, Suite 120 4 Kansas City, Missouri 64108 5 (816) 888-8010 (816) 332-6295 (facsimile) 6 Sharon J. Zinns 7 ZINNS LAW, LLC 4243 Dunwoody Club Drive, Suite 104 8 Atlanta, Georgia 30350 9 (404) 882-9002 sharon@zinnslaw.com 10 Nathan R. Ring Nevada State Bar No. 12078 11 STRANCH, JENNINGS & GARVEY, PLLC 3100 W. Charleston Boulevard, Suite 208 12 Las Vegas, Nevada 89102 13 (725) 235-9750 lasvegas@stranchlaw.com 14 Counsel for Plaintiff David Zussman and the 15 **Proposed Class** 16 Amanda V. Boltax\* 17 HAUSFELD LLP 888 16th Street, NW, Suite 300 18 Washington, DC 20006 19 Amy E. Keller\* 20 James Ulwick\* DICELLO LEVITT LLP 21 Ten North Dearborn Street, Sixth Floor Chicago, Illinois 60602 22 (312) 214-7900 akeller@dicellolevitt.com 23 24 Brian E. Johnson\* COHEN MILSTEIN SELLERS & TOLL PLLC 25 1100 New York Ave., NW, Suite 500 Washington, DC 20005 26 (417) 343-5956 (202) 408-4699 (facsimile) 27 28

1 bejohnson@cohenmilstein.com 2 Douglas J. McNamara COHEN MILSTEIN SELLERS & TOLL PLLC 3 1100 New York Avenue, 5th Floor Washington, DC 20005 4 (202) 408-4600 5 (202) 408-4699 (facsimile) dmcnamara@cohenmilstein.com 6 James J. Pizzirusso\* 7 HAUSFELD LLP 888 16th Street, Ste 300 8 Washington, DC 20006 9 (202) 540-7200 jpizzirusso@hausfeld.com 10 Steven M. Nathan 11 HAUSFELD LLP 33 Whitehall Street, Ste 14th Floor 12 New York, New York 10004 13 (646) 357-1100 (212) 202-4322 (facsimile) 14 snathan@hausfeld.com 15 Nathan R. Ring Nevada State Bar No. 12078 16 STRANCH, JENNINGS & GARVEY, PLLC 17 3100 W. Charleston Boulevard, Suite 208 Las Vegas, Nevada 89102 18 (725) 235-9750 lasvegas@stranchlaw.com 19 20 Don Springmeyer KEMP JONES LLP 21 3800 Howard Hughes Parkway, 17th Floor Las Vegas, Nevada 89169 22 (702) 385-6000 (702) 385-6001 (facsimile) 23 d.springmeyer@kempjones.com 24 Counsel for Plaintiff David Lackey and the 25 **Proposed Class** 26 Marc Dann **Brian Flick** 27 28

1 **DANNLAW** 15000 Madison Avenue 2 Lakewood, Ohio 44107 (216) 373-0539 3 George Haines 4 FREEDOM LAW FIRM, LLC 5 8985 S. Eastern Ave., Suite 100 Las Vegas, Nevada 89123 6 (702) 880-5554 Ghaines@freedomlegalteam.com 7 Gerardo Avalos 8 FREEDOM LAW FIRM 9 8985 S Eastern Ave, Suite 350 Las Vegas, Nevada 89123 10 (702) 880-5554 (702) 967-6685 (facsimile) 11 gavalos@freedomlegalteam.com 12 Javier Merino 13 THE DANN LAW FIRM, PC 1520 Hwy. 130, Ste. 101 14 North Brunswick, NJ 08902 (201) 355-3440 15 16 Kevin Laukaitis Laukaitis Law LLC 17 954 Avenida Ponce De Leon Suite 205, #10518 San Juan, PR 00908 18 (215) 789-4462 19 Counsel for Plaintiff Michael Pircio and 20 the Proposed Class 21 Lawrence Timothy Fisher **BURSOR & FISHER, PA** 22 1990 North California Boulevard, Suite 940 Walnut Creek, CA 94596 23 (925) 300-4455 24 Fax: (925) 407-2700 ltfisher@bursor.com 25 Counsel for Plaintiffs Laura Willis Albrigo and 26 Anita Johnson, and the Proposed Class 27 28

1 Jon A Tostrud (*Pro Hac Vice*) Anthony M. Carter (Pro Hac Vice) 2 TOSTRUD LAW GROUP, P.C. 1925 Century Park East, Suite 2125 3 Los Angeles, CA 90067 (310) 278-2600 4 (310) 278-2640 (facsimile) 5 acarter@tostrudlaw.com jtostrud@tostrudlaw.com 6 Erik H. Langeland 7 LANGELAND LAW 733 Third Avenue, 15th Floor 8 New York, New York 10017 9 (212) 354-6270 (212) 898-9086 (facsimile) 10 elangeland@langelandlaw.com 11 Leon Marc Greenberg LEON GREENBERG, ATTORNEY AT LAW 12 1811 S. Rainbow Blvd., 210 13 Las Vegas, Nevada 89146 (702) 383-6085 14 wagelaw@hotmail.com 15 Rachele R. Byrd (Pro Hac Vice) WOLF HALDENSTEIN ADLER FREEMAN 16 & HERZ LLP 17 750 B Street, Suite 1820 San Diego, California 92101 18 (619) 239-4599 (619) 234-4599 (facsimile) 19 byrd@whafh.com 20 Ruthann Devereaux-Gonzalez 21 LEON GREENBERG, PC 2965 South Jones Blvd., Suite E3 22 Las Vegas, NV 89146 702-383-6085 23 ranni@overtimelaw.com 24 Counsel for Plaintiff David Terezo and the 25 **Proposed Class** 26 F. Peter Silva, II TYCKO & ZAVAREEI LLP 27 28

1 2000 Pennsylvania Avenue NW, Suite 1010 Washington, DC 20006 2 202-973-0900 202-973-0950 (facsimile) 3 psilva@tzlegal.com 4 Nathan R. Ring 5 Nevada State Bar No. 12078 STRANCH, JENNINGS & GARVEY, PLLC 6 3100 W. Charleston Boulevard, Suite 208 Las Vegas, Nevada 89102 7 (725) 235-9750 lasvegas@stranchlaw.com 8 9 Sabita J Soneji TYCKO AND ZAVAREEI LLP 10 1970 Broadway, Suite 1070 Oakland, CA 94612 11 510-254-6808 12 ssoneji@tzlegal.com 13 Counsel for Plaintiff Ronald G. Rundell and the Proposed Class 14 Gary F. Lynch (Pro Hac Vice) 15 LYNCH CARPENTER, LLP 1133 Penn Avenue, 5th Floor 16 Pittsburgh, PA 15222 17 412-233-9243 gary@lcllp.com 18 Mark J Bourassa 19 THE BOURASSA LAW GROUP, LLC 20 2350 W Charleston Blvd, Suite 100 Las Vegas, NV 89102 21 (702) 851-2180 Fax: (702) 851-2189 22 mbourassa@blgwins.com 23 Patrick D. Donathen (Pro Hac Vice) 24 LYNCH CARPENTER, LLP 1133 Penn Avenue, 5th Floor 25 Pittsburgh, PA 15222 412-322-9243 26 Fax: 412-231-0246 patrick@lcllp.com 27 28

Jennifer A. Fornetti
THE BOURASSA LAW GROUP
2350 W. Charleston Blvd., Suite 100
Las Vegas, NV 89102
702-851-2180
jfornetti@blgwins.com

Valerie Christian
THE BOURASSA LAW GROUP
2350 W. Charleston Blvd., Suite 100
Las Vegas, NV 89121
702-851-2180
vchristian@blgwins.com

# Counsel for Plaintiff Charles Bezak and the Proposed Class

Nathan R. Ring Nevada State Bar No. 12078 STRANCH, JENNINGS & GARVEY, PLLC 3100 W. Charleston Boulevard, Suite 208 Las Vegas, Nevada 89102 (725) 235-9750 lasvegas@stranchlaw.com

J. Gerard Stranch IV\*
Andrew E. Mize\*
STRANCH, JENNINGS & GARVEY, PLLC
The Freedom Center
223 Rosa L. Parks Avenue, Suite 200
Nashville, Tennessee 37203
(615) 254-8801
gstranch@stranchlaw.com
amize@stranchlaw.com

Amina A. Thomas\*
COHEN & MALAD, LLP
One Indiana Square, Suite 1400
Indianapolis, Indiana 46204
(317) 636-6481
Itoops@cohenandmalad.com
athomas@cohenandmalad.com

Lynn A. Toops\*

# Counsel for Plaintiff Paul Zari and the

1 **Proposed Class** 2 Linda P. Nussbaum (*Pro Hac Vice*) NUSSBAUM LAW GROUP, PC 3 1133 Avenue of the Americas, 31st Floor New York, NY 10036 4 917-438-9189 5 lnussbaum@nussbaumpc.com 6 Caroline F. Bartlett CARELLA BYRNE CECCHI 7 5 Becker Farm Road Roseland, NJ 07068 8 973-994-1700 9 James E Cecchi 10 CARELLA BYRNE CECCHI OLSTEIN BRODY & AGNELLO 11 5 Becker Farm Road, Ste 2nd Floor 12 Roseland, NJ 07068 973-994-1700 13 Fax: 973-994-1744 jcecchi@carellabyrne.com 14 Nathan R. Ring 15 Nevada State Bar No. 12078 STRANCH, JENNINGS & GARVEY, PLLC 16 3100 W. Charleston Boulevard, Suite 208 17 Las Vegas, Nevada 89102 (725) 235-9750 18 lasvegas@stranchlaw.com 19 Counsel for Plaintiff Michael Manson 20 and the Proposed Class 21 **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE** 22 It is hereby certified that a true and accurate copy of the foregoing was this 19th day of 23 24 March, 2024 filed via the CM/ECF system and served by electronic mail upon all counsel of 25 record. 26 /s/ Nathan R. Ring Nathan R. Ring 27 28